ABSTRACT/PAPER REVIEW FORM
2018 DCA CONFERENCE

Abstract Number: 032

Abstract/Paper Title: The collage in the digital context of architectural representation. Observation of student practice.

Please mark the appropriate column and add mandatory written feedback below. The right hand column is for ranking by numeric number (1 being lowest and 10 being highest) for each row. Please add total.

	YES	Needs Work	NO	Please rank by a numeric number below for each row, 10 being highest 1 being lowest
1. Proposed abstract/paper addresses the conference theme or sub-themes	X			7
2. The content contains some original ideas and contributes to research, or teaching, or practice.	X			9
3. The purpose of the paper is stated clearly.	X			8
4. The paper is well organized and contains all the relevant sections.	X			7
5. The content shows evidence of sufficient background reading and state-of-the-art research and topic.		X		5
6. The research study methods are sound and appropriate.	X			7
7. The writing is clear, concise and interesting.	X			8
8. The references and quotations are clear. The bibliography is updated and relevant.		X		5
9. The conclusions or summary are accurate and supported by the content.	X			7
10. Proposed paper will likely be of interest to conference participants and attendees	X			8
Please Add Total Points from All Rows: 71				

Reviewer General Comments and Suggestions (mandatory written feedback):
The proposed topic and the work conducted with such a high sample is very rich and will offer new critical insights on the technique of collage. I suggest the author/s to make the link to the conference topics stronger and critically discuss how the proposed approach to representation and design will affect the "relationships between virtual and actual in the process and product of design execution". Please, provide a robust literature review of similar research activities and teaching experiences around the topic of collage.

Reviewer Recommendation:
Please indicate which of the following actions you recommend.
(X) 1. **Recommended** (no significant changes suggested)

( ) 2. **Recommended with Reservation** (suggest changes to the manuscript as specified in this review)

( ) 3. **Not Recommended**

ABSTRACT/PAPER REVIEW FORM
2018 DCA CONFERENCE

Abstract Number: 32

Abstract/Paper Title: Collage

Please mark the appropriate column and add mandatory written feedback below. The right hand column is for ranking by numeric number (1 being lowest and 10 being highest) for each row. Please add total.

	YES	Needs Work	NO	Please rank by a numeric number below for each row, 10 being highest 1 being lowest
1. Proposed abstract/paper addresses the conference theme or sub-themes	X			8
2. The content contains some original ideas and contributes to research, or teaching, or practice.	X			8
3. The purpose of the paper is stated clearly.		X		6
4. The paper is well organized and contains all the relevant sections.	X			7
5. The content shows evidence of sufficient background reading and state-of-the-art research and topic.	X			8
6. The research study methods are sound and appropriate.	X			8
7. The writing is clear, concise and interesting.		X		6
8. The references and quotations are clear. The bibliography is updated and relevant.	X			7
9. The conclusions or summary are accurate and supported by the content.	X			7
10. Proposed paper will likely be of interest to conference participants and attendees	X			8
Please Add Total Points from All Rows: 75				

Reviewer General Comments and Suggestions (mandatory written feedback):
Very interesting topic, though the writing was somewhat difficult to follow … perhaps a simpler approach to explaining the process of the exercise would help. What are the pedagogical goals, and how well have they been achieved using this approach to studying collage?

Reviewer Recommendation:
Please indicate which of the following actions you recommend.
( ) 1. **Recommended** (no significant changes suggested)

(x) 2. **Recommended with Reservation** (suggest changes to the manuscript as specified in this review)

( ) 3. **Not Recommended**

Abstract Number: 32

Abstract/Paper Title: The collage in the digital context of architectural representation. Observation of student practice.

Please mark the appropriate column and add mandatory written feedback below. The right hand column is for ranking by numeric number (1 being lowest and 10 being highest) for each row. Please add total.

	YES	Needs Work	NO	Please rank by a numeric number below for each row, 10 being highest 1 being lowest
11. Proposed abstract/paper addresses the conference theme or sub-themes	■			10
12. The content contains some original ideas and contributes to research, or teaching, or practice.	■			9
13. The purpose of the paper is stated clearly.	■			10
14. The paper is well organized and contains all the relevant sections.	■			10
15. The content shows evidence of sufficient background reading and state-of-the-art research and topic.	■			9
16. The research study methods are sound and appropriate.	■			9
17. The writing is clear, concise and interesting.	■			10
18. The references and quotations are clear. The bibliography is updated and relevant.	■			9
19. The conclusions or summary are accurate and supported by the content.	■			10
20. Proposed paper will likely be of interest to conference participants and attendees	■			10
Please Add Total Points from All Rows:				**96**

Reviewer General Comments and Suggestions (mandatory written feedback):

- Looks interesting. Would like to see the pedagogical and theoretical implications of the work.
- Illustrations look photo-realistic. Would like to see initial process drawings.

Reviewer Recommendation:
Please indicate which of the following actions you recommend.

(■) 1. **Recommended** (no significant changes suggested)

( ) 2. **Recommended with Reservation** (suggest changes to the manuscript as specified in this review)

( ) 3. **Not Recommended**